

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]; Farrell, Ericka[Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov]; Covington, Jeryl[Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Thur 2/12/2015 3:50:30 PM
Subject: RE: Assignment - REACH

....
>>>
Ericka-

Are you having a problem uploading to the REACH SharePoint site?

I don't see anything beyond what I uploaded to it last week.

Please let me know if your permissions aren't allowing you to do it, you can't find the material on the OCR shared drive or if someone else needs to be granted permission to upload.

Jeryl-

I know you sent a flurry of emails on funding, but I am not sure what the final word was on whether any other federal agency is giving financial assistance to NC DENR.

Would you please send us a new email (detached from any other chain) that gives us all the basic information about current or most recent financial assistance.

Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Monday, February 09, 2015 3:21 PM
To: Farrell, Ericka; Covington, Jeryl
Cc: O'Lone, Mary
Subject: Assignment - REACH
Importance: High

Ericka-

I need you to please work with the law clerks and upload relevant materials to the REACH SharePoint site that Mary. Regarding relevant materials, I believe all the items that Mary copied into a REACH folder on the OCR shared drive should be it. Please have this done by **February 11, 2015**. I have copied Mary in case I have misunderstood.

Also, I need you and Jeryl to check and see if NC DENR gets financial assistance from USDA (or anyone else). Please have this information to me, with a cc to Mary, by **February 10, 2015, COB**.

Appreciate your help.

Helena

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights – US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Fri 9/12/2014 10:59:26 PM
Subject: RE: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn;
Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

.....
,,.,.,.,.,.

So does this mean that the 20 days starts running from the date of the acknowledgement letter (i.e., today)?

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Friday, September 12, 2014 6:57 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Subject: Fwd: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

Draft but will send the signed versions. The file # is in the letter.

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Whickum, Cheryl" <Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov>

Date: September 10, 2014 at 11:01:00 AM EDT
To: "Wooden-Aguilar, Helena" <Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>
Cc: "Farrell, Ericka" <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>
Subject: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

A Warm & Hearty...

Ms. Helena:

Hard copy of the above have been prepared for finalization, reviewed/initialed by Ms. Ericka, placed in your box, & are ready for your concurrence/signature.

Thank you,

Cheryl Whickum

U. S. EPA, Office of Civil Rights

Title VI - External Compliance Program

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, WJC-North, Rm 2524

Mail Code: 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-4366 (Direct Line)

202-564-7272 (Office Line)

202-565-0196 (Fax Line)

From: Whickum, Cheryl
Sent: Wednesday, September 10, 2014 10:34 AM
To: Farrell, Ericka
Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: FOR REVIEW - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

A Warm & Hearty...

Ms. Ericka:

Hard copy of the above has been prepared for finalization, placed in your box, & is ready for your review/concurrence.

Thank you,

Cheryl Whickum

U. S. EPA, Office of Civil Rights

Title VI - External Compliance Program

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, WJC-North, Rm 2524

Mail Code: 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-4366 (Direct Line)

202-564-7272 (Office Line)

202-565-0196 (Fax Line)

From: Farrell, Ericka

Sent: Tuesday, September 09, 2014 9:36 AM

To: Whickum, Cheryl

Subject: Notification Letters - Earthjustice/NC

Good Morning Ms. Cheryl,

Can you please finalized for Ms. Helena's signature. Thanks.

Ericka Farrell

Office of Civil Rights

External Complaints & Resolution

2025640717

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Fri 9/12/2014 11:12:30 PM
Subject: RE: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn;
Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

.....
,,,,,,,

So the 20th day is Sept. 30th (it is 20 days of acknowledging receipt).

If we wait that long, the thing will be ripe!

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Friday, September 12, 2014 7:04 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Subject: Re: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio,
Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

No we sent it out on the 10th

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Sep 12, 2014, at 6:59 PM, "O'Lone, Mary" <OLone.Mary@epa.gov> wrote:

So does this mean that the 20 days starts running from the date of the acknowledgement letter (i.e., today)?

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena

Sent: Friday, September 12, 2014 6:57 PM

To: O'Lone, Mary

Subject: Fwd: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

Draft but will send the signed versions. The file # is in the letter.

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Whickum, Cheryl" <Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov>

Date: September 10, 2014 at 11:01:00 AM EDT

To: "Wooden-Aguilar, Helena" <Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>

Cc: "Farrell, Ericka" <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>

Subject: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _

EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

A Warm & Hearty...

Ms. Helena:

Hard copy of the above have been prepared for finalization, reviewed/initialed by Ms. Ericka, placed in your box, & are ready for your concurrence/signature.

Thank you,

Cheryl Whickum

U. S. EPA, Office of Civil Rights

Title VI - External Compliance Program

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, WJC-North, Rm 2524

Mail Code: 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-4366 (Direct Line)

202-564-7272 (Office Line)

202-565-0196 (Fax Line)

From: Whickum, Cheryl

Sent: Wednesday, September 10, 2014 10:34 AM

To: Farrell, Ericka

Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena

Subject: FOR REVIEW - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn;
Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

A Warm & Hearty...

Ms. Ericka:

Hard copy of the above has been prepared for finalization, placed in your box, & is ready for your review/concurrence.

Thank you,

Cheryl Whickum

U. S. EPA, Office of Civil Rights

Title VI - External Compliance Program

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, WJC-North, Rm 2524

Mail Code: 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-4366 (Direct Line)

202-564-7272 (Office Line)

202-565-0196 (Fax Line)

From: Farrell, Ericka

Sent: Tuesday, September 09, 2014 9:36 AM

To: Whickum, Cheryl

Subject: Notification Letters - Earthjustice/NC

Good Morning Ms. Cheryl,

Can you please finalized for Ms. Helena's signature. Thanks.

Ericka Farrell

Office of Civil Rights

External Complaints & Resolution

2025640717

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Fri 9/12/2014 11:19:55 PM
Subject: RE: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn;
Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

.....
>>>>>>>
Is it dated the 10th?

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Friday, September 12, 2014 7:04 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Subject: Re: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio,
Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

No we sent it out on the 10th

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Sep 12, 2014, at 6:59 PM, "O'Lone, Mary" <OLone.Mary@epa.gov> wrote:

So does this mean that the 20 days starts running from the date of the acknowledgement letter (i.e., today)?

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena

Sent: Friday, September 12, 2014 6:57 PM

To: O'Lone, Mary

Subject: Fwd: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

Draft but will send the signed versions. The file # is in the letter.

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Whickum, Cheryl" <Whickum.Cheryl@epa.gov>

Date: September 10, 2014 at 11:01:00 AM EDT

To: "Wooden-Aguilar, Helena" <Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>

Cc: "Farrell, Ericka" <Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov>

Subject: FOR REVIEW/SIGNATURE - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn; Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

A Warm & Hearty...

Ms. Helena:

Hard copy of the above have been prepared for finalization, reviewed/initialed by Ms. Ericka, placed in your box, & are ready for your concurrence/signature.

Thank you,

Cheryl Whickum

U. S. EPA, Office of Civil Rights

Title VI - External Compliance Program

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, WJC-North, Rm 2524

Mail Code: 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-4366 (Direct Line)

202-564-7272 (Office Line)

202-565-0196 (Fax Line)

From: Whickum, Cheryl

Sent: Wednesday, September 10, 2014 10:34 AM

To: Farrell, Ericka

Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena

Subject: FOR REVIEW - Lado, Marianne Engleman and D'Ambrosio, Jocelyn;
Reeder, Tom Ltrs - Re _ Notify Receipt of Admin Cmplnt _ EPA File No _ 11R-14-R4

A Warm & Hearty...

Ms. Ericka:

Hard copy of the above has been prepared for finalization, placed in your box, & is ready for your review/concurrence.

Thank you,

Cheryl Whickum

U. S. EPA, Office of Civil Rights

Title VI - External Compliance Program

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, WJC-North, Rm 2524

Mail Code: 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-4366 (Direct Line)

202-564-7272 (Office Line)

202-565-0196 (Fax Line)

From: Farrell, Ericka

Sent: Tuesday, September 09, 2014 9:36 AM

To: Whickum, Cheryl

Subject: Notification Letters - Earthjustice/NC

Good Morning Ms. Cheryl,

Can you please finalized for Ms. Helena's signature. Thanks.

Ericka Farrell

Office of Civil Rights

External Complaints & Resolution

2025640717

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]; Golightly-Howell, Velveta[Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov]; Dorka, Lilian[Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov]; Rhodes, Julia[Rhodes.Julia@epa.gov]
Cc: Moffa, Anthony[Moffa.Anthony@epa.gov]; Covington, Jeryl[Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov]; O'Lone, Mary[olone.mary@epa.gov]
From: Farrell, Ericka
Sent: Wed 5/27/2015 7:40:18 PM
Subject: RE: EPA File No.: 11R-14-r4

.....

Due to those extenuating circumstances I believe we should do the interview.

Ericka

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Wednesday, May 27, 2015 2:09 PM
To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta; Dorka, Lilian; Rhodes, Julia
Cc: Moffa, Anthony; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka; O'Lone, Mary
Subject: FW: EPA File No.: 11R-14-r4

All-

I have just received this email below. Thoughts?

Helena

From: Marianne Engelman Lado [<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>]
Sent: Wednesday, May 27, 2015 1:11 PM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: EPA File No.: 11R-14-r4

Dear Helena,

I'm writing with regard to EPA File No. 11R-14-R4, a complaint under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 filed on behalf of the North Carolina Environmental Justice Network, REACH and the Waterkeeper Alliance, Inc. As you know, the case has been referred to alternative dispute resolution and we are pursuing this approach. We understand that EPA's investigation is put "on hold" during this process, see <http://www.epa.gov/civilrights/faq-adrt6.htm>, but complainants request that the Office of Civil Rights might interview Steve Wing in the interim given significant and extenuating circumstances.

As you know, Dr. Wing and one of his graduate students, Jill Johnston, submitted a report and disproportionality analysis that was attached to the complaint. He is also an epidemiologist who has expertise on the impacts of CAFOs on people living and going to school in proximity to the facilities, and also on the disproportionate impacts on the basis of race. This spring he learned

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

over the last few months. Fortunately, he has

a tremendous spirit and remains fully engaged in his work, and he is willing to set up an interview with OCR over the summer. I am hopeful that you can accommodate his schedule and arrange an interview, even if the investigation is on hold.

I look forward to your response.

Best,

Marianne

Marianne Engelman Lado

Managing Attorney, Northeast Office

Earthjustice

48 Wall Street, 19th Floor

New York, NY 10005

T: 212.845.7393

F: 212.918.1556

earthjustice.org



The information contained in this email message may be privileged, confidential and protected from disclosure.

If you are not the intended recipient, any dissemination, distribution or copying is strictly prohibited.

If you think that you have received this email message in error, please notify the sender by reply email and

delete the message and any attachments.

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Mon 3/9/2015 4:04:35 PM
Subject: Fw: Question about REACH ADR

.....
??????

Does Will know he's supposed to reach out to both sides this week? Will wasn't ccd on V's email to Van der Vaar, so you might want to let him know just in case he wasn't clear.

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Hall, William
Sent: Monday, March 9, 2015 9:24 AM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: RE: Question about REACH ADR

My advice is that it would definitely be a negative to send the RFI letter at this point. It would send confusing signals to the recipient, to whom the ADR option was just presented and who responded positively.

Will

William E. Hall, Ph.D.
Conflict Prevention and Resolution Center
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
"Making Agreement Easier" | (202) 564-0214
<http://intranet.epa.gov/adr> or <http://www.epa.gov/adr>

From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Friday, March 06, 2015 9:07 AM
To: Hall, William
Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: Question about REACH ADR

Will-

At the staff level, OCR's draft request for information to NC DENR is ready to go out.

Lilian wanted us to touch base with you to see if you thought that sending it out would be a plus or minus in getting NC DENR to the table based on the conversation with them on Wednesday. Thanks, Mary

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Tue 2/24/2015 11:47:00 PM
Subject: RE: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH

.....
>>>>>

Sorry I didn't scroll down far enough.

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Tuesday, February 24, 2015 6:31 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Subject: Re: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH

Yes. I tried to send her the few q's we had below and if other pop up we will can and verify on writing. Make sense?

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Feb 24, 2015, at 6:29 PM, "O'Lone, Mary" <OLone.Mary@epa.gov> wrote:

I will be at home, can you hook me in before you call her.

I'll send out the usual email with my numbers

Also, is the idea to follow-up on our oral requests for stuff with an email confirming the requests?

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena

Sent: Tuesday, February 24, 2015 6:27 PM

To: O'Lone, Mary; Moffa, Anthony; Covington, Jeryl; Farrell, Ericka

Subject: Fwd: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH

The call is tomorrow at 3:30 pm. You can join me at in the Title VI conference room.

Thanks to you all for your continued help.

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Wooden-Aguilar, Helena" <Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>

Date: February 24, 2015 at 6:25:51 PM EST

To: Marianne Engelman Lado <mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>

Cc: "Wooden-Aguilar, Helena" <Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH

Hi Marianne-

I hope you are well. In preparation for tomorrow's discussion I have enclosed some guiding questions. On the call there will be 2 members of my staff and 2 colleagues from OGC. I will send the names tomorrow morning.

If you have any questions please let me know.

Best,

Helena

1. Do your clients have any evidence of instances where they (or others) have raised to NC DENR the concern/allegation that the adverse impacts from the swine farms are borne disproportionately by African Americans, Latinos, or Native Americans?

2. We see that comments to that effect were raised in the most recent renewal process. Was it raised in the previous General Permit renewal processes, during individual permit processes, in letters to NC DENR outside the public comment process, etc.?

2. Do your clients have any evidence of a timely act for the enforcement allegation in the request for clarification.

Part of the Waterkeeper's statement included a discussion about specific times reported to NC DENR regarding what were thoughts to be violations to NC DENR, while the index of attachments included the general date of photos (Feb. 2014) of the alleged violation (dead pigs overflowing from a dead box/dumpster). Your clients didn't include any specific dates of when he reported incidents.

3. Do your clients have any evidence residents reporting odor or any other impact issues to NC DENR?

4. Do your clients have any other additional information they would like to share with OCR?

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Feb 20, 2015, at 5:23 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado"
<mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Thanks for the follow up.

I'll need to consult with our clients regarding ADR but will do our best to see if we can get back to you on that by the 25th. I'm in a retreat on Monday and Tuesday, so that turnaround time might be tight, but we'll try.

Let's confirm for 3:30 on the 25th. I'd also like to invite our co-counsel from the Center for Civil Rights at UNC School of Law.

Thanks,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]
Sent: Friday, February 20, 2015 3:20 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Matthew, Dayna; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH
Importance: High

Hi Marianne-

Thank you again for your time today. I am sending this email to follow-up on a few items regarding 11R-14-R4 we briefly covered during our 11:30 AM meeting today. Beginning, I would like to first schedule a meeting with you on February 25, 2015, any time after noon. Please let me know if that date and time works for you. The purpose will be to answer any questions you may have about OCR's letter attached and to discuss a few questions we have regarding the accepted allegation.

Secondly, as I stated on the call, OCR is willing to discuss at any point during the process offers to informally resolve the complaint, including alternative dispute resolution (ADR). In that spirit I would appreciate knowing **by February 25, 2015**, the interest of your clients in participating in ADR. Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions or you can visit our URL at <http://www.epa.gov/civilrights/faq-adrt6.htm>.

Thanks again for your time and have a great weekend.

Helena

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Friday, February 20, 2015 11:39 AM
To: 'Marianne Engelman Lado'; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: RE: Accepted: FINAL INVITE 11:30 Call with Marianne Engelman Lado MEETING IS FROM 11:30-12:30
Importance: High

Hi Marianne –

Apologies for not including the information. It is below. I have also included OCR's response to 11R-14-R4 and other materials we intend to go over.

Talk to you soon.

Helena

From: Marianne Engelman Lado [<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>]
Sent: Friday, February 20, 2015 11:36 AM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Subject: FW: Accepted: FINAL INVITE 11:30 Call with Marianne Engelman Lado MEETING IS FROM 11:30-12:30

Helena & Velveta,

I just reached for the phone to call in and realized that I don't have a call-in number.

Is there a number I can call?

Thanks,

Marianne

From: Dorka, Lilian [<mailto:Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>]
Sent: Thursday, February 19, 2015 5:53 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Subject: RE: Accepted: FINAL INVITE 11:30 Call with Marianne Engelman Lado
MEETING IS FROM 11:30-12:30

Sorry for any confusion and the many emails Marianne! We will meet from 11:30 – 12:30. Look forward to speaking with you. Lilian

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Marianne Engelman Lado [<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>]
Sent: Thursday, February 19, 2015 5:50 PM
To: Dorka, Lilian
Subject: Accepted: FINAL INVITE 11:30 Call with Marianne Engelman Lado
MEETING IS FROM 11:30-12:00
When: Friday, February 20, 2015 11:30 AM-12:30 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).
Where: OCR Conference Room 2454

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Wed 2/25/2015 8:35:44 PM
Subject: Re: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH

.....
I am free

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Wednesday, February 25, 2015 2:21 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary; Covington, Jeryl; Moffa, Anthony; Farrell, Ericka
Subject: FW: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH
I am free at 3 pm on Monday. I hope this works for folks.

From: Marianne Engelman Lado [mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org]
Sent: Wednesday, February 25, 2015 1:42 PM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Cc: Jocelyn D'Ambrosio; Haddix, Elizabeth McLaughlin (emclaugh@email.unc.edu)
Subject: RE: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH

I'm canvassing folks on this side, but I think Monday will probably work best. Are you available at 2 or 3?

Thanks,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, February 25, 2015 12:31 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Jocelyn D'Ambrosio; Haddix, Elizabeth McLaughlin (emclaugh@email.unc.edu); Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: RE: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH
Importance: High

Hi Marianne-

Thanks for your email below. I am open to move the call and propose that we speak on Friday, February 25, 2015, at 10 or 11 am. If Friday does not work we can look at Monday of next week. I am open on Monday so please let me know what times work for you.

I look forward to discussing the questions below and hearing from you regarding ADR.

Best to you.

Helena

From: Marianne Engelman Lado [<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>]
Sent: Tuesday, February 24, 2015 9:45 PM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Cc: Jocelyn D'Ambrosio; Haddix, Elizabeth McLaughlin (emclaugh@email.unc.edu)
Subject: RE: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH

Helena,

Thanks for the email. I'm cc'ing my colleagues, who will be joining our call.

We're happy to get on the phone tomorrow and it might be useful to have an initial conversation. Having said that, I want to give you the heads up that we haven't had the opportunity to come to a decision about moving forward with ADR at this point, and I am not sure that we'll be ready to respond fully to the questions we're posing. We were in a retreat all day today and our call tomorrow is scheduled for tomorrow.

Please let me know if you'd like to go ahead tomorrow and/or perhaps move our call to a time later this week or early next week.

Thanks,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]
Sent: Tuesday, February 24, 2015 6:26 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: Re: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH

Hi Marianne-

I hope you are well. In preparation for tomorrow's discussion I have enclosed some guiding questions. On the call there will be 2 members of my staff and 2 colleagues from OGC. I will send the names tomorrow morning.

If you have any questions please let me know.

Best,

Helena

1. Do your clients have any evidence of instances where they (or others) have raised to NC DENR the concern/allegation that the adverse impacts from the swine farms are borne disproportionately by African Americans, Latinos, or Native Americans?

2. We see that comments to that effect were raised in the most recent renewal process. Was it raised in the previous General Permit renewal processes, during individual permit processes, in letters to NC DENR outside the public comment process, etc.?

2. Do your clients have any evidence of a timely act for the enforcement allegation in the request for clarification.

Part of the Waterkeeper's statement included a discussion about specific times reported to NC DENR regarding what were thoughts to be violations to NC DENR, while the index of attachments included the general date of photos (Feb. 2014) of the alleged violation (dead pigs overflowing from a dead box/dumpster). Your clients didn't include any specific dates of when he reported incidents.

3. Do your clients have any evidence residents reporting odor or any other impact issues to NC DENR?

4. Do your clients have any other additional information they would like to share with OCR?

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

On Feb 20, 2015, at 5:23 PM, "Marianne Engelman Lado" <mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org> wrote:

Thanks for the follow up.

I'll need to consult with our clients regarding ADR but will do our best to see if we can get back to you on that by the 25th. I'm in a retreat on Monday and Tuesday, so that turnaround time might be tight, but we'll try.

Let's confirm for 3:30 on the 25th. I'd also like to invite our co-counsel from the Center for Civil Rights at UNC School of Law.

Thanks,

Marianne

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena [<mailto:Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>]
Sent: Friday, February 20, 2015 3:20 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Matthew, Dayna; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: Follow-Up Discussion w/ Earthjustice Regarding REACH
Importance: High

Hi Marianne-

Thank you again for your time today. I am sending this email to follow-up on a few items regarding 11R-14-R4 we briefly covered during our 11:30 AM meeting today. Beginning, I would like to first schedule a meeting with you on February 25, 2015, any time after noon. Please let me know if that date and time works for you. The purpose will be to answer any questions you may have about OCR's letter attached and to discuss a few questions we have regarding the accepted allegation.

Secondly, as I stated on the call, OCR is willing to discuss at any point during the process offers to informally resolve the complaint, including alternative dispute resolution (ADR). In that spirit I would appreciate knowing **by February 25, 2015**, the interest of your clients in participating in ADR. Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions or you can visit our URL at <http://www.epa.gov/civilrights/faq-adrt6.htm>.

Thanks again for your time and have a great weekend.

Helena

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Friday, February 20, 2015 11:39 AM
To: 'Marianne Engelman Lado'; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Cc: Dorka, Lilian; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Subject: RE: Accepted: FINAL INVITE 11:30 Call with Marianne Engelman Lado
MEETING IS FROM 11:30-12:30
Importance: High

Hi Marianne –

Apologies for not including the information. It is below. I have also included OCR's response to 11R-14-R4 and other materials we intend to go over.

Talk to you soon.

Helena

From: Marianne Engelman Lado [<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>]
Sent: Friday, February 20, 2015 11:36 AM
To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Subject: FW: Accepted: FINAL INVITE 11:30 Call with Marianne Engelman Lado
MEETING IS FROM 11:30-12:30

Helena & Velveta,

I just reached for the phone to call in and realized that I don't have a call-in number.

Is there a number I can call?

Thanks,

Marianne

From: Dorka, Lilian [<mailto:Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>]
Sent: Thursday, February 19, 2015 5:53 PM
To: Marianne Engelman Lado
Subject: RE: Accepted: FINAL INVITE 11:30 Call with Marianne Engelman Lado
MEETING IS FROM 11:30-12:30

Sorry for any confusion and the many emails Marianne! We will meet from 11:30 – 12:30. Look forward to speaking with you. Lilian

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Marianne Engelman Lado [<mailto:mengelmanlado@earthjustice.org>]
Sent: Thursday, February 19, 2015 5:50 PM
To: Dorka, Lilian
Subject: Accepted: FINAL INVITE 11:30 Call with Marianne Engelman Lado
MEETING IS FROM 11:30-12:00
When: Friday, February 20, 2015 11:30 AM-12:30 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).
Where: OCR Conference Room 2454

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]; Covington, Jeryl[Covington.Jeryl@epa.gov]
Cc: Moffa, Anthony[Moffa.Anthony@epa.gov]; Farrell, Ericka[Farrell.Ericka@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Tue 2/24/2015 2:59:22 PM
Subject: RE: REACH

.....
,,.,.,.,.

Yes I have one that I started for DCROs. We can adjust it a little closer to the date of the briefing since he doesn't want one for several weeks.

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Monday, February 23, 2015 5:15 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary; Covington, Jeryl
Cc: Moffa, Anthony; Farrell, Ericka
Subject: Fwd: REACH

See below. Do we have a briefing doc? If not, can we generate one?

Helena Wooden-Aguilar

Assistant Director

External Civil Rights - US EPA

202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Golightly-Howell, Velveta" <Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov>
Date: February 23, 2015 at 9:40:32 AM EST
To: "Wooden-Aguilar, Helena" <Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>
Cc: "Dorka, Lilian" <Dorka.Lilian@epa.gov>, Dayna Bowen Matthew
<Dayna.Matthew@Colorado.EDU>
Subject: Fw: REACH

Hi Helena. Will you please follow up re: scheduling the briefing for Matt?

Velveta

From: Tejada, Matthew
Sent: Friday, February 20, 2015 6:09 PM
To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Cc: Lee, Charles; Dorka, Lilian; Wooden-Aguilar, Helena; Matthew, Dayna; Packard, Elise; Rhodes, Julia; O'Lone, Mary; Colaizzi, Jennifer C.; Sinha, Prasiddh
Subject: Re: REACH

Hanks Velveta. Let's shoot for a briefing in mid March. Helena can work with Mr Sinha copied here to find a good time.

Thanks

M

Matthew S. Tejada

Director

EPA Office of Environmental Justice

(202) 564-8047

On Feb 20, 2015, at 5:44 PM, Golightly-Howell, Velveta <Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Matthew. I wanted to let you know that today OCR issued the attached letters accepting for investigation one allegation and requesting clarification on another made in the Title VI complaint filed in September 2014 by Earthjustice claiming discrimination related to swine feeding operations in North Carolina. Specifically, OCR will investigate whether:

- North Carolina DENR's regulation of swine feeding operations discriminates against African Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans on the basis of race and national origin in neighboring communities and violates Title VI and EPA's

implementing regulations.

We anticipate the investigation will be controversial. We are prepared to organize a briefing or provide background should you need it. Please contact Helena Wooden-Aguilar of my staff if you would like to schedule a briefing or obtain any background information. Also, please refer any press inquiries about this matter directly to Jennifer Colaizzi in OPA (202-564-7776). Jennifer is prepared to field all inquiries.

Velveta

Velveta Golightly-Howell

Director, Office of Civil Rights

Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Mail Code 1201A

Washington, DC 20460

202-564-6685

To: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena[Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov]
From: O'Lone, Mary
Sent: Wed 2/18/2015 5:40:39 PM
Subject: Re: NC Title VI Case, next steps?

.....
>>>>>>

I had no idea Eva was a contact for REACH or that we had any contact in OECA for REACH.

Or is she asking b/c I had REACH listed in the DEN stuff as a complaint that raised enforcement allegation we would likely be requesting clarification on?

I am guessing she referred Eva to you? Maybe you (or V) should ask her if she is the Title VI contact now b/c I'd been working through Caroline Emmerson to get names of people in OECA who could help me with CAFO related questions. Are we supposed to now coordinate with Eva in addition to Caroline or is she Caroline's replacement? Or is Eva only interested in the cases that involve the enforcement allegations?

Mary O'Lone

Civil Rights and Finance Law Office

Office of General Counsel

US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 564-4992

From: Wooden-Aguilar, Helena
Sent: Wednesday, February 18, 2015 12:34 PM
To: O'Lone, Mary
Subject: Fwd: NC Title VI Case, next steps?
I explained to her who Eva was.

Helena Wooden-Aguilar
Assistant Director
External Civil Rights - US EPA
202-564-0792 (office)

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

wooden-aguilar.helena@epa.gov

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Golightly-Howell, Velveta" <Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov>
Date: February 17, 2015 at 12:36:20 PM EST
To: "Wooden-Aguilar, Helena" <Wooden-Aguilar.Helena@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: NC Title VI Case, next steps?

WHO IS EVA AND WHAT'S HER ASSOCIATION WITH REACH, HELENA? HER NAME SOUNDS FAMILIAR. VELVETA

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Kreisler, Eva" <Kreisler.Eva@epa.gov>
Date: February 17, 2015 at 10:11:11 AM EST
To: "Golightly-Howell, Velveta" <Golightly-Howell.Velveta@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: NC Title VI Case, next steps?

Hi Velveta,

Just checking-in again to find out what our next steps will be for the NC Title VI case. Thanks.

Eva H. Kreisler, Senior Attorney

International Compliance Assurance Division

U.S. EPA (2254A)

Office (202) 564-8186

Fax (202) 564-0073

kreisler.eva@epa.gov

Help EPA fight pollution by reporting environmental violations on EPA's website at <http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html>

This email, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and it may be protected by the attorney-client or other privileges. This email, including attachments, contains information that is intended to be conveyed only to the designated recipient(s).

From: Kreisler, Eva
Sent: Monday, February 09, 2015 1:07 PM
To: Golightly-Howell, Velveta
Subject: NC Title VI Case, next steps?

Hi Velveta,

Just wanted to check-in and find out what the next steps will be regarding the NC Title VI case. Thanks!

Eva H. Kreisler, Senior Attorney

International Compliance Assurance Division

U.S. EPA (2254A)

Office (202) 564-8186

Fax (202) 564-0073

kreisler.eva@epa.gov

Help EPA fight pollution by reporting environmental violations on EPA's website at <http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html>

This email, including attachments, contains information that is confidential and it may be protected by the attorney-client or other privileges. This email, including attachments, contains information that is intended to be conveyed only to the designated recipient(s).